

In the name of God

The Enemies of Imam Mahdi (a.t.f.s.)

Introduction

The *Baha'i Research center* aims to provide a place for interaction and dialogue, and tries to present accurate information documented by the Baha'i books and writings, and I thank God for helping me to study and achieve this aim.

From the beginning, one of the important goals of this website has been discussing about uprising of the promised Mahdi (A.S) according to Baha'i beliefs. To this end, both Muslims and Baha'is are free to talk about their ideas in our different forums.

For reviewing what has been discussed in these forums, *Baha'i Research* decided to conduct a comparative study, about the Mahdawiyat in Islam and Baha'i. We hope this work will be helpful for the interested. The name of this book was chosen after finishing the research, so it shouldn't be misunderstood as a kind of misjudge about them. Actually after finishing research about the Baha'is, the author couldn't find a title better than this one.

It should be mentioned that:

- 1- Readers are approximately familiar with the effective Baha'i figures throughout history, so the author has not discussed about different people and the value of their speech among the Baha'is. Those who are not familiar with Baha'is are recommended to read the book *Genesis*. (the first book in the *Baha'i Research series*)
- 2- In the second chapter of the book, a short biography of Imam Mahdi (A.S.) is provided. Some of his characteristics are selected for making a comparative study. The footnotes and references are from both the Shia and Sunni books, to make it as a

good source for Sunnis, and also take distance from misconceptions of the two Islamic schools disputes.

3- Minimum number of footnotes has been used in this chapter to introduce different references, although for each topic many other sources can be used. Actually, these different references indicate the vast expansion of *Mahdiism* in Islam.

4- The historical citations from the Baha'i sources and other books are used only for presenting their thinking, and making a good comparative study. The author does not confirm all of them.

5- One of the important principles of historical studies is invoking to different and independent sources. In this study, all of the historical citations are from those authoritative books confirmed by the Baha'is, written by their leaders (Bab, *Baha'ullah*, *Abdul-Baha*, and *Shoghi Effendi*) or published by their organizations. The author prefers to use their own books because the independent historical sources of the last two centuries (Muslim governments specially Qajar dynasty) criticizing Baha'is may be accused of collaborating with the political system of those days. So there is no way for denying these citations by the Baha'is. Whenever a book is used for the first time, a short biography and its authority among Baha'is are expressed to assure the readers about authority of the documents.

6- A problem in using Baha'i sources is that since some books have different editions, citation from a book with a specific edition is not accorded with other editions. The previous books of *Baha'i Research* were collected according to the old versions of those books. But in the present book, the digital versions are taken into account. So we kindly ask readers to have in mind these points while considering references:

- a) The page numbers of the sources are based on the digital version of *Bahai library software* compiled by the Bahais. If the specific source had an older printed version, the page number is shown in parentheses after the digital page number.

b) There is no digital version for some of the Bahai books, such as *Kashf-ul-gheta*, *Rahiq-e- Makhtoum*, and *Al-Kavakeb Al-dorriah*. Therefore, whenever there are no parentheses after the page number, the citations are from these old editions.

c) The citations from *kitab-i- Iqan (the book of certitude)* are firstly from its edition in Germany, but in the parentheses, also, the page number of the current *Iqan* that has 199 pages is provided.

7- This book could not be completed or published without collaboration of a small village of people, and I thank all of them for helping and guiding me in this study. Though I know there's no need for gratitude, since they have pure intentions in their guidance.

8- Although the author attempted to provide a good work, this is not empty of weak points, and asks readers and researchers to inform their suggestions via *Bahai Research Website*, to make this book a complete one.

Finally, I respectfully dedicate this book to Imam Mahdi (May God hasten his glad Advent) that his consent smile will be enough for the author.

1) Two Questions

The Bahais believe that in the 19th century , a prophet ,whose name was *Mirza Hussein Ali Noori* later known as “Bahauallah”, appeared and brought a new religion from God. After this manifestation, the Babi dispensation ended and people obliged to follow him. They believe that *Mirza Ali Muhammad Shirazi* (the Bab) is the twelfth Imam of Shias, who is redeemer of humanity and the promised man in Islam. He is, they say, the one whom Muslims had been awaiting for him thousands of years. Since it had been narrated that the promised man of Islam is the one who will bring a new religion and a new holy book .*Bab* has brought the book of *Bayan* (Exposition) for terminating Islam. In fact, the Bab’s followers, before being Babi, were Shias, believing in glad tidings of the Shia books about their religion. That is why Bahais believe that, before the Bab’s manifestation, the Shia religion had been the true belief among different Islamic sects.¹

Consequently, the followers of Bahauallah, also, before being Bahais, were Babis believing in glad tidings of *Mirza Ali Muhammad-e Shirazi* about appearance of *Bahauallah* as their prophet.²

Therefore, the Bahais who believe that their religion is the continuation of Babi dispensation and so far, the continuations of Islam (Shia) believe that among different Islamic sects, before the Bab’s manifestation, Shia thoughts had been the true belief. They also believe that alongside the Bab’s glad tidings about the prophet hood of their messenger, there has been such good news about Bahauallah in Shia books, too.

Mirza Hussein Ali Noori or whoever else, claiming to bring a new religion for humanity, should answer these two basic questions:

¹ *Sahifeye Adliyyeh* (the epistle of justice), Mira Ali Muhammad-e Shirazi (the Bab), p.26

² In addition to Bahais, there are other people also who follow Mirza Ali Muhammad-e Shirazi. This people believe that Bahais misuse the name of Seyyed Bab. They are called “Azali” because they believe that Seyyed Bab has appointed *Mirza Yahiya Sobh-e-Azal* (Bahauallah’s brother) as his successor and Bahauallah has rebelled against him. Talking about this matter requires another article.

- 1- According to verses of Quran and traditions from the Prophet of Islam and our Imams (P.B.U.T), one of the certain Islamic beliefs is that the prophet of Islam, Muhammad-ibn-Abdullah (P.B.U.H.), is the last and seal of the prophets of God, who has brought religion of Islam for humanity and until the Last Day, no more religion will come from God. So how can it be possible that Muhammad-ibn-Abdullah (P.B.U.H.) as the last messenger of God died and after him, in spite of the assertions, another one came as a prophet?
- 2- According to the Islamic teachings, God has promised that finally a man from the progeny of the prophet Muhammad (PBUH), whose name is the same as the holy Prophet, and Muslims know him by the title of *Mahdi*, will rise and put an end to oppression, and prevail justice in the world. This is one of the basic beliefs of Muslims and many books have been written about it. *Mahdi* (A.S.) is the promised man of Islam and Muslims have been waiting for his appearance up to now. However, if one claims that he is the messenger of God, bringing a new religion, should have one of these qualifications : He should be the promised man of Islam. Or he should be able to introduce that promised man before himself, or he should claim that the promised man of Islam would come after the appearance of the new religion's prophet.

The last supposition seems unrealistic because it cannot be accepted that the promised man of the previous religion comes after the appearance of the prophet of the next religion! Therefore, the Baha'is should claim that their leader, Bahauallah, is the promised man of Islam, or they have to prove that the promised *Mahdi* has appeared and his characteristics are matched with those predicted in traditions. Baha'is prefer the second way i.e. they claim that *Mirza Ali Muhammad Shirazi* (better known as *the Bab*) is the promised Qa'im. He is the one that by his appearance, Baha'is say, the divine promise of "Mahdiism" has been achieved and after him, the new prophet has appeared.

Now, the question is whether the Bab's characteristics are the same as the characteristics of Imam Mahdi (PBUH), mentioned in the Islamic traditions, or not.

In this book, we consider the Baha'is' claim about the promised *Mahdi* throughout history, and then we will compare it with the Muslims' beliefs. Afterwards, the teachings of their so called promised *Mahdi* is considered to find the correctness of their claims regarding abolition of Islam, Reappearance of the promised *Mahdi*, and then appointment of a new prophet are believable. Research about the belief in prophet of Islam (P.B.U.H.) as the last prophet of God, and the contradiction of this belief with appointment of a new prophet will be done in another book.

2) The Muslims' belief in *Mahdi*

Among the major beliefs of Muslims is that *in the last time, a man from the progeny of the holy Prophet of Islam will rise and put an end to the oppression and corruptions around the world.*³

Despite different disputes among Muslims, in different topics, Mahdi-hood and the appearance of the *Savior* is approximately confirmed by all of the Islamic sects.⁴

- Muslims know this promised man as *“Mahdi”, “Qa'im”, “Baqiatallah i.e. God's remain”*⁵. He is a divine leader who, like other leaders, has gone the path of

³ Shia references: *Behar-al-Anvar (the ocean of lights)*, vol. 10, 29, 49,32,50,74,85,90,92. Sunni references: *Al-fotuhah Al-Makkieh*, Muhammad Mohye al-din Ibn Arabi (one of the famous Sunni mystics), vol.3, chapter 366, p. 327,328. *Al-Aqaed Al-Islamieh (Islamic beliefs)*, Al-Seyyed Sabegh (the professor of Al-Azhar University in Egypt), p. 250

⁴ In following pages, different Shiite and Sunni references confirming this belief, are used.

⁵ *Surah al-Hud, verse 86*: “*what remains with Allah is better for you if you are believer*”.

According to Shiite references, Forat commentary, p. 193, it was asked from Imam Sadeq (A.S.), the sixth imam of Shias: “how can we greet Qa'im?” He answered: “you'd better say ‘Asalamo Alayka ya Baqiatallah’ (Peace be upon you, O' the remainder of God)” and then he recited this verse.

Kamal al-din, Sheikh Sadouq, vol.1, p.33: Seyyed Homeiry narrated that he asked Imam Sadeq (A.S.): “we have heard from your fathers some news about occultation, let us know who among you will have such occultation?”

Imam (A.S.) answered: “this will happen for my sixth child who is the twelfth Imam after our prophet (P.B.U.H.), those Imams whom their first one is the commander of the believers, Ali Ibn-e Abi Taleb, and their last one is the true *Qa'im* and *the Reminder of God in the earth* and *the Lord of our Age*. By God, if he stays in his occultation the same years as Noah had been among his followers, he would not die except he will appear and bring justice to the earth, as it had been full of oppression and injustice.

straight and will rise to reform his grandfather's followers' situations. By his revolution, he will settle the affairs of the world. He will appear when the world is full of oppression and injustice, and his rising will bring justice to the world.

- After his magnificent appearance, *only one God will be worshiped and the call of monotheism will ring in the ears. Security will be extended throughout the world*⁶, *the righteous will inherit the earth,*⁷ *and Islam will be superior to all religions*⁸.
- Although, first, he will teach and advise his opponents, but if he receives no response from them, he will give them the final notice; and if they do not accept, he will draw his *justice sword* towards pagans and will overcome them powerfully⁹ as if after his magnificent appearance, *there will be no pagan on the earth*¹⁰.
- *At the time of his appearance, Jesus Christ is among those who will return to earth and will be appointed as one of his advisors. He will pray behind Mahdi, and will help him in his revolt and in establishment of justice*¹¹.
- His rising is so definite that the prophet of Islam (P.B.U.H.) said about it: *"if there remains only a day for the world to come to an end, Allah will prolong this day till He raises a man from my progeny, whose name is the same as me, and he will fill the earth with justice and equity, as it would have fraught with injustice and oppression."*¹²

⁶ *Surah Al-e-Imran, verse 55.* Shiite reference: *Tavil al-ayat*, p.365. Sunni reference: *Yanabi al-mavadah*, Soloman al-Qonduzi Al-HAanafi, p. 426

⁷ *Surah al-Anbia (the prophets), verse 105.* Shiite reference: *Kanz al-Daqayeq*, vol.8, p.483. Sunni reference: *Al-Dor Al-Manthour*, Jala al-din-e Soyouti, vol. 5, p.687

⁸ *Surah al-Saf (the ranks), verse 9.* Shiite reference: *Osul-e-Kafi*, Sheikh Koleini, vol. 1, p.432. . Sunni reference: *Noor-ul-absar*, Muhammad Ibn Ali Al-Sabian, p.186 (published in Cairo)

⁹ *Ayashi commentary*, vol. 1, p.183 for Surah Al-e-Imran, Verse 83: "...and to Him submits whoever is in the heavens and the earth, willingly or unwillingly..."

¹⁰ Shiite references: *Kamal al-din*, Sheikh Sadouq, vol.2, p.670. Sunni references : *Yanabi Al-mavadah*, p.423

¹¹ Shiite references: *Osul-e Kafi*, Sheikh Koleini, vol. 8, p.49. *Behar al-anvar*, Allame Majlesi, vol. 51, p.77, 84, 90,137. Sunni references: *Tahzib Al-Tahzib*, Ibn Hajar-e Asqalani, vol.9, p.126. *Al-manar Al-Monif*, Muhammad ibn Abibakr-e Dameshqi, p.142. *Al-Jame Al-Islamiyah magazine*, article: the belief of Sunnis in Awaited Mahdi, by Abd-ul-Mohsen Ibn Hamd Ebad (one of the contemporary writers), published in the Saudi Arabia, num. 3, 1th year, p.598

¹² Shia reference: *Occultation*, Shaykh Tousi, p.180. Sunni reference: *Sahih*, Tarmezi, vol. 2, p.46 and *Sahih*, Abi Davoud, , vol.2, p. 207(published in Egypt)

- Because no one knows him during his occultation, *there is no oppressed ruler's allegiance submitted to him* ¹³ and whenever he begins his revolution, there will be no allegiance on him.
- *After the establishment of his fair worldwide government, not only there will be no war and enmity, but also the earth will be filled with peace and friendship* ¹⁴.
- *The earth will give out its treasures and blessings will be descended from heaven* ¹⁵. *The people's living will be so good that the rich men will go after the poor to pay their charities, but they will find no one in need* ¹⁶.
- Like other Imams, *he is the true successor of the prophet of Islam (P.B.U.H.) in sanctity*, and people have to obey his commands certainly.
- *He is the son of Imam Hassan Askari (A.S.), he is the ninth children of Imam Hussein (A.S.), and his mother is the master of the servants of the world* ¹⁷.
- *His name is same as the name of the prophet of Islam, he will have a lengthy occultation* ¹⁸ in which the believers will be tested, and after those tests, the good and bad will be recognized and distinguished.
- Because of this lengthy occultation ¹⁹, *the Islamic traditions, especially the Shia narrations, anticipate a lengthy life for him, same as the prophet Noah.* ²⁰
- Although he is hidden from the people's eyes for some reasons in his occultation, *like other Imams, he is like a refuge for his followers and assists them. He is the cause of divine emanation and takes care of whoever calls him and will look after him friendly* ²¹.

¹³ **Kamal Al-Din**, Sheikh Sadouq, vol.1, p.315. **Kefayat-ul- Asar**, p.224; it is narrated by Imam Hasan-e Mojtaba (A.H.) after his reconciliation with Moavia.

¹⁴ **Shiite reference: Montakhab Al- Asar**, chapter 2, part 1. **Sunni reference: Sahih**, Abi Davoud, vol. 2, p.208

¹⁵ **Shiite reference: Khesal**, Shaykh Sadouq, vol.2, p.626. **Sunni reference: Al- Mostadrak ala Al- Sahihein**, vol.4, p.557

¹⁶ **Ershad**, Shaykh Mofid, vol.2, p.380

¹⁷ **Behar Al- Anvar**, Allame Majlesi, vol.51, p.76

¹⁸ **Osul-e Kafi**, Sheikh-e Koleini, vol.1, p.527 (Lowh tradition)

¹⁹ 91 traditions have been narrated in the book of **Montakhab Al- Asar** from both Shiite and Sunni references.

²⁰ **Kamal Al-Din**, Sheikh Sadouq, vol.1, p.322

²¹ **Osul-e Kafi**, Sheikh-e Koleini, vol.1, p.200; narrated by Imam Reza (A.S.) expressing the characteristics of Imam Mahdi (A.S.)

- Like other Imams, he is infallible, having divine knowledge. So occultation just means that he is not permitted to execute the religious laws worldly, that people are not aware of his place of living, and that they cannot know him by meeting.

Those who are a little familiar with the promised *Mahdi* in Islam have heard about these titles or may have read about them in different books. One may attend in his birthday ceremonies, and may be familiar with his kind attention. Certainly, he is aware of our deeds and it is important that to what extent we can communicate with him and profit by his emanation.

The fact is that the belief in such a savior keeps a Shia hopeful to call the twelfth Imam in his occultation and look at the removal of the historical submissiveness of the prophet's progeny.

3) Those who claimed to be Mahdi through history

The true belief of Muslims, both Shias and Sunnis, in the rise of the son of the prophet of Islam has been so influential among the Muslims that many people tried to introduce themselves as the promised *Mahdi*, deceiving some simple-hearted people, to achieve their goals. Among Sunnis, also some claim to be *Mahdi*. The appearance of these people who wrongly pretend themselves as *Mahdi* is an indicator of the depth of this belief among Muslims.

Among the recent Sunni claimants were *Gholam Ahmad Qadiani* and *Mahdi Sudani*, who made their claims at the time of colonization of the Islamic lands, when people were harassed of tyranny of colonists. Gradually People joined them and in some cases, they gained victories. They were trying to make similarities between themselves and the Promised *Mahdi* of Islam, as was mentioned in traditions, to assure their followers of their honesty.²²

People were sure that a man from the progeny of the prophet will appear to dismantle oppression and injustice in the world, the oppression that was obvious in the

²² For being familiar with those who claim as Mahdi, refer to the book of *Mahdi-hood claimers from the beginning of Islam up to now* written by Ahmad Soroush.

colonial's behavior, so they thought by following these claimers, they would play effective role in spreading justice throughout the world. The primary victories also motivated them more because they believed that by *Mahdi's* uprising, the monotheist government will be established in the world and they supposed these victories as an introduction to later victories promised in Quran and traditions. Some followers also were deceived by the false similarities; they supposed themselves in a specific position in assisting the son of the Prophet of Islam.

4) How can we recognize false claims?

Since tens of people, through history, have claimed that they are the promised *Mahdi*, there must be some criteria to recognize the true and false claims. These criteria should be restricted only to one person to guide people, to follow the rightful Imam or leader. Many of the followers of the false claimers joined them only because they found a few similarities between the claimers and the promised savior of Islam.

Is coming from the progeny of the prophet enough for being as the promised *Mahdi*? If it is so, all of the holy Prophet's children introducing themselves as Qa'im (upholder) should be trusted. Although having this characteristic is a requisite for being the promised *Mahdi*, surely it is not enough.

On the other hand, can we say that whoever accepted and followed by people is the promised *Mahdi* of Islam? According to history, we have at least 30 men claimed to be *Mahdi*. Which one of them is the true one?

Alternatively, is rising in Mecca, besides Ka'ba', the only characteristics of the promised *Mahdi*? If so, many of the false claimants began their projects over there, to assure people that they are *Mahdi*!

The characteristic mentioned in the second part of this book have two points. First, it is difficult for a false claim to meet all of those superior qualifications. Second, these characteristics have been mentioned in many Shia and Sunni traditions, to the extent that there is no way for distorting or denying them! The best way to find the

deceitfulness of these claims is to compare the life and outcomes of these persons with those of true *Mahdi* narrated in traditions.

5) Who is Mira Ali Muhammad-e Shirazi (BAB)?

Baha'is believe that the promised Qa'im of Islam is *Mira Ali Muhammad-e Shirazi* known as *Seyyed Bab*, who appeared in 1260 A.H. and abolished the rules of Islam. They claim that *Bab* had given some glad tidings about a man, called *Mira Hussein Ali Nouri* (better known as *Bahau'llah*) who has brought new teachings for humanity, guiding them towards the straight path.

Now, let's see what are the characteristics of Seyyed Bab who claimed to be *Mahdi* and what are the Baha'i assertions about him? How is the life of this man, and how can he fulfill the desires of Mahdi-hood in Islam? Baha'is have to prove the fulfillment of these desires before the appearance of their prophet.²³

The Baha'is say:

➤ *Mirza Ali Muhammad Shirazi* was one of the sons of the prophet of Islam, who claimed as Mahdi in 1260 or 1264 A.H. He could not establish the global monotheist government and establish justice in the world. Baha'is “*interpreted*²⁴ *the sovereignty of the Qá'im as a mystical sovereignty, and His conquests as conquests of the cities of hearts*”²⁵ and assert that “*sovereignty means the all-encompassing, all-pervading power which is inherently exercised by the Qá'em, whether or not He appear to the world clothed in the majesty of the earthly dominion. This is solely dependent upon the will of the Qá'em Himself.*”²⁶

²³ it was mentioned in the first part on the title of “two questions”

²⁴ Bahais also grant no right for themselves in paraphrasing and interpreting texts

²⁵ *A traveler's narrative*, Abbas Effendi (Abdul-Baha), p.9. Persian version: *Maqalih Shakhsi Sayyah*, p.16

²⁶ *Kitab-i-Iqan*, the first book of Baha'u'llah in proving the claim of Bab as Qa'em, p.33 (English version)

- Not only Bab couldn't dismantle oppression and injustice during his lifetime, but also 48 years after his uprisings and wars ,and 42 years after his death “*in every city the evidences of a tyranny, beyond like or equal, were unmistakably clear and manifested*”²⁷. Abdul-Baha, the second leader of the Baha'is, 59 years after the Bab's uprising said about the world: “*nowadays, all people in the world are drowned with their passions, busy with their materialistic goals, addicted to enmity and hatred, thinking about annihilation of each other, they want to eliminate each other totally*”²⁸
- Not only he was not capable to reform the affairs of his grandfather's followers and revive Islam, but also he called Quran as an abrogated book, and put an end to Islam by introducing the book of *Bayan* (Exposition). Abolishing Islam was firstly proclaimed by *Baha'u'llah* in Badasht. There the Babis proclaimed “*abrogation of the Qur'nic Law, repudiating both the divinely-ordained and man-made precepts of the Faith of Muhammad, and shaking off the shackles of its antiquated system.*”²⁹
- After the Bab's manifestation, not only polytheism and idolatry have not been uprooted, but also he added a new god to the previous gods! He introduced himself as a deity in his final writing.
- Not only their promised Mahdi had been under the control of the Iranian government, but also he couldn't answer the questions of religious authorities in the trial meeting of the Iranian crown-price, and even clergies pointed some of his “*grammatical mistakes*”³⁰. Finally, he repented and apologized from the king of Iran³¹ because of his false claims!

²⁷ ***Epistle to the son of the wolf***, Baha'u'llah, p. 30. Persian version: Lowh-I ibn-I Zaa'bl, p.54.it is written for one of Shia clergies called “Shaykh Muhammad Baqer-e Esfahani”. Baha'u'llah called this man as “the son of the wolf”

²⁸ ***Addresses***, Abdul-Baha, vol.2, p.9 (the series of Abdul-baha's speeches)

²⁹ ***God passes By***, Shoghi Effendi, p.26. Persian version: Qarn-I Badi, vol.1, p.97 (178). The Badasht incident will be described in the sixth chapter of this book.

³⁰ ***A traveler's narrative***, Abdul-Baha, p. 8. Persian version: ***Maqalih Shakhsi Sayyah***, p.13 (23). In Arabic, the syntax is concerned with the connection of words with each other, the role of each word in a sentence, the correct use of every word and the pronunciation of words. Abdul-Baha means that Seyyed Bab's statements in this tribunal weren't grammatically correct to the extent that scholars criticized him for that. In next chapters, more syntactic mistakes of Bab's writings and speeches will be considered.

➤ His name is not the same as the name of the holy Prophet of Islam (P.B.U.H.) and he did not have any lengthy occultation. He was born “*on the first day of Muharram, 1235 A.H.*”³² and “*In 1260[A.H.], when He was 25years old*”³³ he declared the claim of being Bab³⁴. He was executed at the time of king Naser Al- din while he was 31year. Therefore, he did not have any lengthy occultation and lengthy life, and the allegiance of the tyrants were on him. If we accept the Bahai belief that the beginning of his claims had been in 1260 A.H., the total period of his appearance as Mahdi had been 6 years and some months, and if we refer to other references³⁵ and suppose the first year of his claims, in 1264 A.H., then the total periods will decrease to only 3 years!

➤ His father, *Muhammad Reza*³⁶ was a cloth-seller so he is not the son of Imam Hasan Askari (A.S.), and there is a lot of distance (surely more than 9 generation!) between he and Imam Hussein (A.S.). His mother was *Fateme Beigom*³⁷ who never had been a slave girl.

➤ **Unfortunately, Jesus Christ had no resurrection after the Bab’s manifestation; and surprisingly, one of the teachings of this false claimant had been prohibition of the congregational prayer!**³⁸ So how could Jesus pray behind the promised Qa’im as asserted in both the Shia and Sunni traditions?

³¹ *Kashf al-gheta an Heial al-Ada (uncovering the enemies’ deceits)*, Abul-Fazl Golpayegani, p.204. This book was written by the order of Abbas Effendi for rejecting one of the charters of Edward Brown (introduction to Alkaf point of Haj Mirza Jani-e Kashani) and it was not finished because of the author’s death. after him, his nephew Seyyed Mahdi Golpayegani finished it by using the notes of his uncle.

³² *A traveler’s narrative*, Abdul-Baha, p.2. Persian version: *Maqalih Shakhsi Sayyah*, p. 1 (2)

³³ *A traveler’s narrative*, Abdul-Baha, p.2. Persian version: *Maqalih Shakhsi Sayyah*, p.2 (3)

³⁴ *A traveler’s narrative*, Abdul-Baha, p.2. Persian version: *Maqalih Shakhsi Sayyah*, p.2 (3)

³⁵ We will refer to some of these texts in the sixth part

³⁶ *A traveler’s narrative*, Abdul-Baha, p.2. Persian version: *Maqalih Shakhsi Sayyah*, p. 1 (2)

³⁷ *Hazrat-e Noqteye Ula* (The beloved primal point), Mohammad Ali Feizi, p.64. this book has been admitted by National Bahai publishing trust

³⁸ *the Persian Bayan*, p.324

Besides, Bab had no victory in any war, and the Qajar army forces defeated his followers three times, while that army was one of the weakest armies of those days.³⁹

Many other historical facts cannot be ignored after the Bab's manifestation; the economic problems of societies were not ended after his appearance and different economic crises has occurred during next 170 years afterwards! Nowadays, according to the United Nations organizations, many people are living under the poverty line and there is no place for peace and friend ship among humanity. After his appearance, many people were killed in the international and regional wars, Terrorism has been one of the major problems of global society, and plundering the weak nations is among the orders of the world powers. Considering these global problems, one can easily understand that human being has not achieved peace and security in spite of the Baha'is' claims.

As a result, the characteristics of the promised *Mahdi* of Islam cannot be accorded to the Bab's characteristics and consequently, the religion of Islam cannot be abolished as the Baha'is claim. They cannot answer even a simple question that what happened for the promised and awaited Mahdi of Islam! Therefore, there is no need to consider other reasons they bring to prove the truth of their Faith.⁴⁰

6) What happened to the Bab?

In order to consider the Bab's life and claims, and to find out why people followed him, we should know more about the social and historical background of his movement.

6-1) Shaykhi beliefs caused the development of Babi dispensation

As we mentioned in the book of *Genesis* (the first book of *Baha'i Research* series), *Ali Muhammad Shirazi* was a young man in 1260 A.H. ,when he claimed that he is the

³⁹ In the sixth part of this article, we will explain some of these wars.

⁴⁰ As it was mentioned in the first part of this article, Bahairesearch website is going to discuss about the contradictions between "the seal of the prophets" and "appearance of a new prophet".

Bab (or gate) of the twelfth Imam of Shias. For Shaikhi people of those days, *Bab* meant having a special communication with Imam *Mahdi* (A.S.). The first one who claimed to have such a special communication was *Shaikh Ahmad Ahsaei*, the founder of Shaikhi group. Then, *Seyyed Kazem Rashti* who was one of his pupils, proclaimed that position for himself.

Shaikh Ahmad asserted that he loved the Shia infallible Twelve Imams and talked about them. He believed there should be a divine communicator (or Bab) between the Muslims and their awaited Imam, who is invisible. He claimed the communicator as “a prominent hamlet” between Imam and people⁴¹ by referring to Quran, granted certain privileges to them such as familiarity with the divine knowledge of Imams. He proclaimed that he owned the characteristics of these Hamlets and finally claimed that he is the communicator between the twelfth Imam and Muslims.

Actually Sheikh Ahmad opened the discussion of the specific deputation of the twelfth Imam⁴² which had been closed since the major occultation of Imam Mahdi (A.S.) in 329 A.H. Afterwards, he called himself a specified deputy of Imam and “the hamlets prominent” between Imam and people implicitly. He believed that the only difference between “the four deputies of the twelfth Imam” and “the hamlets prominent” is that the former had been appointed under the official order of Imam while the latter hold this position because of the great qualifications they have.

⁴¹ In *Rashtie pamphlet*, Sheikh Ahmad Ahsaei referred to this verse (Chapter Al-Saba, verse 18) for drawing out this title. The verse says: “***we had placed between them and the towns which we had blessed hamlets prominent (from the main rout) and we had ordained the course through them, travel through them in safety, night and day***”. Imam Sadeq (A.S.) in his comment about this verse has said that “*the towns which we had blessed*” are twelve infallible Imams and “*hamlets prominent*” are Muslim scholars. Shaikh Ahmad borrowed this idea from this narration and attributed it to himself. Although most of Shiite scholars interpreted the traditions about this verse in the same manner, there are different ideas in applying this special word.

⁴² The period in which Imam Mahdi (A.S.) communicated with people via specified deputies is called “minor occultation”. In this period, Imam answered the people’s questions and received the religious taxes by these deputies. The specified deputies of Imama Mahdi (A.S.) were Osman Ibn Said and his son Mohammad Ibn Osman who were among the outstanding friends of Imam Askari (A.S.), Hussein Ibn Rouh-e Nobakhti, and Ali Ibn Muhammad-e Seimori.

Shaikh Ahmad died in 1242 A.H. and appointed his outstanding student, *Seyyed Kazem Rashti*, as his successor. Seyyed Kazem continued the path of his teacher while he asserted that he is a Shia, believing in the twelve Imams.

Seyyed Kazem expressed his beliefs in his will, in the beginning of the book of *collection of pamphlets*, as follows:

I attest that Muhammad ,son of Abdullah, is the servant and the messenger of God. All religions has been abolished except Islam which will remain until the day of Judgment...I attest that the prophet introduced 12 persons as his successors, and they are: Ali son of Abi-Taleb,.... and then Hojjat son of Al-Hasan, who will extend justice in the world. He will not die unless he destroys idolatry in the world.⁴³ O my God, these are my Imams... whatever the prophet has said is truth, and there is no doubt about it and his religion will be steadfast forever.

6-2) the fourth pillar of the faith

Seyyed Kazem Rashti invited people to find “the prominent hamlet” and actually, he invited them to follow him! He believed the four pillars of religion, which should be known, are God, the Prophet, Imam (leader), and successor of Imam or “the hamlets prominent”. Since knowledge about God, the Prophet, and the Imam is not accessible for people, they have to try to find the fourth pillar or a pure follower by whom they can know other pillars. In other words, according to Shaikhi beliefs, knowledge of the fourth pillar is the precedent to the knowledge of Imam (because they believed that Imam’s outstanding position is to the extent that usual people cannot know him) and

⁴³ Please compare these beliefs with the beliefs of Muslims about Mahdi (A.S.) (mentioned in the second part) and with the Bahais’ beliefs about him (in the fifth part)! Seyyed Bab and The Bahai leaders praised and respected Sheikh Ahmad Ahasai and Seyyed Kazem Rashti so the beliefs of these two persons are important and can be helpful for researchers.

knowledge of Imam is a precedent to knowledge of the prophet and finally to the knowledge of God.

Many simple-minded Shias who wished to know their twelfth Imam and satisfy him followed Seyyed Kazem and He found many disciples. Finally, Seyyed Kazem died in 1259 A.H. and because he didn't appoint a successor, some of his disciples such as *Haj Karim Kahn Kermani*⁴⁴, *Mirza Shafie Tabrizi*⁴⁵, *Mirza Taher Hakkak Esfahani*⁴⁶, and *Mirza Ali Muhammad Shirazi* claimed that they are his successors. The belief in the knowledge of the fourth pillar had been so prominent among Sheikhi people that all of claimers believed that they possess this qualification.

6-3) A young man from Shiraz!

As it was mentioned in the previous parts, since Seyyed Kazem Rashti appointed no successor after his death as “the forth pillar of faith”, the one who should be communicator between Muslims and the Twelfth Imam, his followers had many disputes among themselves.

Although most of the followers of *Seyyed Kazem* accepted *Haj Mohammad Karim Khan Kermani* as his successor, other young followers like *Mulla Hussein-e Boshrouei* tried to find another one. He Came to Shiraz and met *Mirza Ali Muhammad-e Shirazi* as they knew each other previously. After this meeting, *Mirza Ali Muhammad* claimed to be the fourth pillar of faith on the Jamadi-ul-awal 5th, 1260 A.H. and the first man trusted him was *Mulla Hussein*. Afterwards, *Mirza Ali Muhammad* presented his commentary of Chapter Joseph in Quran as a proof for his claim, and again, *Mulla Hussein Boshrouei* was the first man believing in it. This commentary is known as *Qayyoum-ul-asma*, and Mirza Ali Muhammad asserted that he had taken it from **“Muhammad son of Hasan ,son of Ali ,son of ...Hussein ,son**

⁴⁴ Nowadays, most of Sheikhi people follow him. Their center is in Kerman and their leader is one of the grandsons of Haj Muhammad Karin Khan.

⁴⁵ He was influential in Azerbaijan but he died a few months after Seyyed Kazem Rashti.

⁴⁶ He went to Istanbul and found some disciples. Finally, he claimed that he is the promised Mahdi and was poisoned and died.

of Ali, son of Abu Taleb!” or the awaited Imam of the Shias, *Mahdi*. This claim is completely in contradiction with his later claims and what Baha’is insist in it. Since first of all, the Bab claimed to be the communicator of Qa’im or *Imam Mahdi*, but surprisingly, afterwards he claimed to be the same Imam!

These contradictions were dangerous warning for the Bahai leaders, to the extent that despite, their emphasis on holiness of this book⁴⁷, they never publish it completely. This book was the Bab’s first book in which his claim is only the deputyship of Imam Mahdi while at the time of his death, he claimed that he is Qa’im, the claim propagated in the Baha’i teachings nowadays. The Baha’is have published only some parts of the book. When it comes to the part that Bab admits that *Imam Mahdi* is the son of Imam Hasan Askari (a.s.), and he is the upholder, and then Bab introduces himself as the deputy of him, they prefer to omit all the text and end the matter as they will.

Now, in the age of information explosion and science expansion, the question rises about the expense of complete publishing of this book for the Baha’is. Is this due to the scandal that the publication of the whole text will bring for them?

Although, we have the complete version of this commentary, but in order to prevent rejecting this article by the Baha’is, we will refer only to those parts that exist in the Baha’i books.

Abdul-Hamid Ishraq Khavari, the famous Baha’i authors and teachers, cited from the Bab’s commentary of chapter Joseph in his book, *Rahiq makhtom (a pure drink that is sealed)*:

*Truly, God has destined to reveal this book about the best story
(Chapter Joseph) from Muhammad son of Hasan, son of Alison of*

⁴⁷ The prophet of Bahais in the *kitab-i-Iqan* (book of certitude) which is one of the main books of Bahais has written: “Glorified be God, in his first book namely *Qayyum-ul-asma* which is the first, the most glorious and the greatest of all books, he gave word of his martyrdom”

Ali, son of Abi Talib, from the people of Zikr (followers of the Reminder)⁴⁸ to be the deputy of God.⁴⁹

However, after the Bab's claim and Mulla Hussein Boshroui's trust on him, some shaikhi people followed him. They thought that Bab was deputy of the twelfth Imam, and the fourth pillar of the Shaikhi school. They were devoted to *Imam Mahdi*; so they accepted the Bab's claim, and then, they prepared themselves to scarifice in his way, that was a part of their faith.

6-4) The first repentance of Bab in the Vakil mosque in Shiraz

Baha'is assert that *Bab* went to hajj in 1261 A.H.⁵⁰. Tthen, in his return, he went to Bushehr and wrote to one of his Shaikhi followers, *Mulla Sadeq Khorasani*,⁵¹ to add this sentence in the Aza'n of the congregation prayer: “ *I witness Ali before Nabil⁵² is gate of Baqiytullah (remnant of God)*” i.e. I witness that Ali Muhammad Bab is the gate (communicator) of *Imam Mahdi* (a.s.). Mulla Sadeq, who recited Azan, obeyed him and that deviation jangled Shiraz to the extent that people asked punishment of its cause.

Consequently, the governor of Shiraz, *Nizam al-doula Hussein Khan Ajudan Bashi*, arrested Mulla Sadeq. He confessed that the Bab had ordered him to do so, and presented the Bab's writings, such as Surat-ul-Mulk. After that confession, Nizam Al-doula summoned the Bab from Bushehr.

⁴⁸ Mirza Ali Muhammad

⁴⁹ ***Rahiq-e-Makhtom*** (a pure drink that is sealed), vol.1, p.21-24. This book was published in Tehran in 1340, confirmed by Bahai organization. The second edition of this book had been published in 1352 and this statement is in p.33-37.

⁵⁰ The authenticity of this claim is under question and it needs another article to discuss about it.

⁵¹ This instruction was given to him in ***The treatise of Khasael al-sab'e*** (seven characteristics), summary of Nabil history, p.122

⁵² According to abecedarian (Abjad letters), both Muhammad and Nabil have the same number, and usually Seyyed Bab, whose name was Ali Muhammad called himself Ali before Nabil.

Nabil Zarandi narrated this event in his history book⁵³ on pages 129-131 that they brought the Point ⁵⁴ respectfully to Shiraz. A meeting was organized in which the leader of the congregational prayer (Imam Jome) and the governor of Shiraz were present. They interrogated the Bab for his order. At the beginning, the Bab and Nizam-ul-dula argued because of a misunderstanding. It was to the extent that Nizam-al-dula ordered to slap Bab! Then the leader of congregation prayer interceded for him and after caressing him, asked about his claim. The Bab replied, *“I’m neither the deputy of the awaited Imam nor the communicator between Imam and people. Then the Imam Jomeh said “that’s enough!”*

Afterwards, In order to eliminate the public excitement, they asked the Bab to confess again in front of people in Vakil mosque in Shiraz. On Friday, Bab ascended the pulpit and cursed himself and his followers as follows:

Curse be upon those who call me the deputy of the awaited Imam. Curse be upon the one who calls me the Gate of Imam... curse be upon the one who calls me the denier of Imam (leadership) of the commander of the believers (Imam Ali) and other Imams.

6-5) Escaping to Isfahan, and the Maku prison

Seyed Bab escaped from Shiraz to Isfahan in 1262 A.H. ,and there, he was under the protection of *Manuchehr Khan Gorgi*, the Russophile governor of Isfahan. His claim was so expanded in Isfahan that *Manuchehr khan* accepted it, and protected him officially. People were out of patience and complaint against *Manuchehr khan*. Consequently, *Muhammad* Shah Qajar ordered to transfer the Bab to Tehran. But *Manuchehr Khan* interceded and helped him to live secretly in Isfahan. He was living

⁵³ The original text of this book has never been published because it compromises reasons rejecting Baha’is’ claims. *Shoghi Effendi* who was the last leader of Bahais summarized the book and published it on the name of ***The dawn breakers***. This book was translated to Arabic and its name changed to ***Matali’ul-Anvar***. Finally, the book was translated from Arabic to Persian by *Eshraq khavari*, known as ***The summary of Nabil’s Narrative***. This book is among the most authentic and famous book of Baha’is.

⁵⁴ It is one of the nicknames of Ali Muhammad Shirazi among the Baha’is.

there up to the death of Manuchehr khan in 1263.⁵⁵ After governor's death, his nephew, *Gorgin Khan* became the governor, and under the order of *Mirza Aghasi* sent Seyed Bab to Tehran. It was in the middle way that the government commanded to transfer Bab to Maku (A city of the west Azerbaijan) that was under the control of the crown prince, *Naseruddin Mirzaye Qajar*. Thus, the so-called promised Mahdi of the Babis & Baha'is was transferred to prison, instead of conquering the world!

6-5) the Bab's beliefs and claim in the beginning of his imprisonment

After being imprisoned, Bab insisted on his position as *the fourth pillar of the faith* and *the gate of the twelfth Imam (a.s.)*. But he didn't proclaim to be the promised Qa'im. He even referred to some of the supplications or traditions narrated by twelfth Imam of the Shias. For example, he referred to a supplication of *Hojjat Ibn Al-Hasan Al-Askari*, narrated by his second deputy; *Muhammad Ibn Osman*, in the period of the minor occultation, available in the primary Shia books⁵⁶, and used the supplication to prove his claims.

In the third part of the book of *Zohourul-haq* (the advent of truth), pages 13-16, some parts of a treatise is mentioned, written to one of the followers of Seyed Kazem Rashti in Maku, in Jamadi-ul-awal of 1263 A.H.. In page 14, it is mentioned: "***Just as Hujjat (peace be upon him) expressed in his supplication in the month of Rajab: by those authorities that thou have, O' my God...***"

It is clear, According to this citation, that Seyed Bab, in the month of Jamadi-al-aval of 1263 A.H., had been confessing on the existence of Imam Mahdi (a.s.) and even he referred to one of his supplications. Therefore, until 1263 A.H., the only claim of Seyed Bab had been the fourth pillar of the faith as one of the basic beliefs of Sheikhi people of those days. Until then, the Bab had no claim being as the promised

⁵⁵ It is mentioned in the book of *The footprint of tzar* (the second book of the present series)

⁵⁶ *Eqbal al-amal*, p.693, Seyed Ibn Tavous (the Shia scholar in the 7th century)

Qa'im or at least, if he had such a claim in his mind, he did not mention it at his writings or speeches.

6-7) preparations for Badasht event

After imprisonment of Seyed Bab, his followers began their terrorist and subversive proceedings. One of the Bab's followers was *Fateme Zarintaj*, known as *Tahere qurat-ul-ain*. She was *Mulla Muhammad Taqi Qazvini's* nephew and daughter-in-law. Mulla Mohammad Taqi was one of the opponents of Babi and Shaikhi thoughts. Fateme became a Sheikhi, left her husband and child, and went to Karbala, when *Seyyed Kazem Rashti* was alive. After his death, she became one of the followers of Seyed Bab. Since she was brought up in a clergy family, she organized a class after death of Seyed Kazem in Karbala. In spite of the traditions of those days men participated in it. Tahere uncovered her hijab and presented her speeches in an attractive manner. It was there when a group of Shaikhi people were attracted by her behavior. One of them was *Mirza Saleh Shirazi*. After imprisonment of the Bab in Maku, Zarintaj returned to Qazvin and commissioned Mirza Saleh to assassinate Mulla Mohammad Taqi in the mosque, because he was one of the opponents of Bab and Sheikhi people. One morning, Mirza Saleh attacked Mulla Mohammad Taqi while he was praying and martyred him by a cold weapon.⁵⁷ After this assassination, Mirza Saleh was arrested and imprisoned in Tehran. Zarintaj was under the control of the government either. But she could escape to Tehran, under the support of *Mirza Hussein Ali Noori* who was one of the followers of Bab.⁵⁸ *Mirza Hussein Ali* prepared the conditions for a gathering in Badasht and commissioned Tahere over there. He rent three gardens on that area and remained in one of them. Then he settled Tahere in the next one, and a Babi whose name was *Muhammad Ali Barforoushi*⁵⁹ in the third

⁵⁷ The details of this assassination differed in Bahai books but all of them agree that followers of Bab had killed Sheikh Mohammad-e Qazvini when he was praying in the mosque.

⁵⁸ *Asar-e-Goharbar* (the precious writings), Ali Akbar Forutan, p.9 (Germany, Langhain, 1986)

⁵⁹ *Barforoush* was the other name for Babel in Mazenderan, north of Iran.

garden.⁶⁰ After all, he invited some of the Babi people, being his guests, on that village. After 22 days, *Mirza Hussein Ali Nouri, Zarintaj, and Barforoushi* became hosts of more than 80 Babis in Badasht.

6-8) the Badasht event

That event occurred when Bab was imprisoned in Azerbaijan. His followers communicated with him, but it was not to the extent that they could receive all of his orders. Many of those who gathered in Badasht were Shaikhi Muslims, believing in the Bab as the Gate to Imam Mahdi, or fourth pillar of the faith. Yet, some of his followers such as *Bab-ul-Bab* (Mulla Hussein Boshroui) as the first believer, were not invited to the gathering.

One of the important events occurred during that gathering, beginning in Jamadi Al-awal of 1264 A.H., was that Bahauallah wrote a tablet every night, ordering the Bab's followers what to do. In those tablets, he conferred appellations to himself and others and never told them that he himself had written them. *Shoghi Effendi* points to those tablets clearly in the book *God passes by*:

The eighty-one disciples who had gathered from various provinces were His guests from the day of their arrival to the day they dispersed. On each of the twenty-two days of His sojourn in that hamlet, He revealed a Tablet, which was chanted in the presence of the assembled believers. On every believer, He conferred a new name, without, however, disclosing the identity of the one who had bestowed it. He Himself was henceforth designated by the name Bahá. Upon the Last Letter of the Living⁶¹ was conferred the appellation of Quddús, while Qurratu'l-'Ayn was given the title of Táhirih. By these names, they were all

⁶⁰ *God Passes by*, p.25. Persian version: the book of *Qarn-e Badii*, vol.1, p.94 (172).

⁶¹ Bahais believe that the first believers were 18 people among whom the first one was *Molla Hussein Boshroui*, known as Bab-ul-Bab and the last one was *Molla Mohammad Barforoushi* known as Quddus. Since according to Abjad letters, the word "Hay" (or living) equals number 18, they call these 18 believer "letters of living"

*subsequently addressed by the Báb in the Tablets He revealed for each one of them.*⁶²

In the last days of this gathering, everything went to its climax.⁶³ Tahirih uncovered her hijab, unveiled and showed up herself among the Bab's followers and proclaimed that the Bab is the *promised Mahdi* whom by his appearance, Islam is terminated. Therefore, its ordinances should be deposited and to this end, she unveiled her hijab. After performing this role, coming into agreement with hosts, the Bab's followers were divided into three groups according to Shoghi Effendi in the book of *God passes by*:

The first group was mostly the Bab's followers from Maragheh and some others who found the contradictories between his claims and their belief about *Imam Mahdi* in religion of Islam. Therefore, they converted to Islam. Shoghi Effendi says:

Fear, anger, bewilderment, swept their inmost souls, and stunned their faculties. 'Abdu'l-Kháliq-i-Isfáhání, aghast and deranged at such a sight, cut his throat with his own hands. Spattered with blood, and frantic with excitement, he fled away from her face. A few, abandoning their companions, renounced their Faith. Others stood mute and transfixed before her. 64

The oppositions towards Tahiri's actions were not finished. *Mulla Hussein Boshrouie* who was the first believer of the Bab, after hearing the news of the gathering said: " *if I was in Badasht, I would had punished those people with my sword.* "65

The second group was those followers satisfied with what she had done and didn't proclaim any protest and opposition.

⁶² *God Passes by*, p.25. Persian version: *Qarn-e Badii*, vol.1, p.94 (172, 173).

⁶³ In the first volume of the book *Al-Kavakeb al-Dorriah*, *Avare* states that among the Babi nobles, there has been some discussion about proclaiming the abolishing of Islam but the generality of Babis were not aware of these discussions. That is why the aim of this gathering had been expressed in terms of attempting to free Bab from prison in Maku. However Bahauallah, Zarintaj, and Barforoushi had other goal which seems to be achieved after the gathering.

⁶⁴ *God Passes by*, p.25. Persian version: *Qarn-e Badii*, vol.1, p.95 (174,175).

⁶⁵ *Tarikh-e Zohour ul-haq (The history of advent of the truth)*, by Fazel-e Mazandarani (one of the famous Bahai teachers), third part, p.110

The third group was some people like *Mohammad Ali Barforoushi* (whom Bahauallah had conferred the appellation of Quddus in his letters) objected Tahiri but did not leave the scene.⁶⁶ Finally, those anger and objection was propitiated by Tahiri's excited speech to the extent that protesters confirmed her. At this time, Tahiri proclaimed "*I am the Word which the Qá'im is to utter, the Word which shall put to flight the chiefs and nobles of the earth!*"⁶⁷

After those events, praying was omitted from daily ordinances of the Babi people⁶⁸ and "*the prayer-carpets, which were always rolled out, was removed not to be extended again*"⁶⁹ and the prayer beads were called idols and had been broken.⁷⁰

6-9) the Bab's claim to be the promised Qa'im

There are many disputes among the Baha'is about the exact date of this claim; but it is obvious that he didn't proclaim it before the Badaht event. The question is that whether the Bab, before this event and when he said that he is Bab of *Imam Mahdi*, had any other hidden claim or not? Regardless of this main question that how it is possible that a divine messenger claims having a position while he does not have its qualifications, we refer to Shoghi Effendi's assertions about pretending this claim after the Badaht event. He writes in *God Passes by*:

Almost immediately after, the Báb Himself, still a prisoner, was vindicating the acts of His disciples by asserting, formally and unreservedly, His claim to be the promised Qá'im, in the presence of the Heir to the Throne, the leading exponents of the Shaykhí community,

⁶⁶ *Al-kavakeb Al-dorriah*, Abdul-Hussein Ayati, vol.1, p.130. The author asserts in this Bahai book that this objection had been preplanned before the gathering. *Barforoushi* should discuss with Tahiri and finally, he had to be satisfied by her reasoning about termination of Islam and its ordinances. Only in this way, other followers would accept this claim.

⁶⁷ *God Passes by*, p.25. Persian version: *Qarn-e Badii*, vol. 1, p.96 (176)

⁶⁸ Badaht event occurred in 1264 A.H. the date is important since *Molla Hussein Boshroui* (the first believer of Bab) was praying until the last days of his life as it is mentioned in Bahai resources and it shows that he didn't believe in the abolition of the religion of Islam, mentioned by Bab. So he didn't believe in the prophecy of Bab and his claim as Qa'im. More explanations about this topic is expressed in the part 12-6.

⁶⁹ *Tarikh-e Zohour ul-haq* (*The history of advent of the truth*), by Fazel-e Mazandarani, p.111

⁷⁰ *Qamus-e Toqi-e Manii*, vol.2, p.5-6. This book was written by *Eshraq Khavari* to explain the statements of the tablet of *105 Manii* by Shoghi Effendi.

*and the most illustrious ecclesiastical dignitaries assembled in the capital of Ádhirbayján.*⁷¹

Therefore, the first place the Bab asserted his claim to be Mahdi and the promised Qa'im had been in the crown prince's meeting in Tabriz, but Shoghi Effendi insisted to date back the primary claim to fifth of Jamadi al-awal in 1260 A.H. and its assertion after the Badasht event. In spite of these attempts to change the dates of claims assertions, the Bab himself ,in many cases, has confirmed and at the same time contradicted the claims!⁷²

6-10) the second repentance, the crown prince meeting

As it is mentioned in the book of *Genesis*, in 1264 A.H., when Naseruddin Mirza was the Crown Prince, the Bab was summoned to Tabriz. In his first day of arrival, he asserted his claim to be the promised Mahdi for one of his followers, *Ali Torshizi*⁷³. It was the first time that he asserted such a claim.⁷⁴ However, the Bab was interrogated in the meeting of the Crown prince, where some of his servants and the leading exponents of Tabriz had attended. The results of every meeting are stated in a record prepared and endorsed by the attendants. The head of the meeting was *Naseruddin Mirza*, and he had to send the records of the meeting for King Muhammad. In this part, first, this record and the official letter are considered to find Naseruddin's opinion about the Bab's and then, the appendices of the letter, which were the Bab's repentant letter and exponents' ideas about him, are mentioned. That meeting is described in the book of *Kashf ul-gheta an heial al-ada* (uncovering the secrets of enemies' deceits) which is an authoritative document for the Baha'is. The crown prince's letter to King Muhammad is also mentioned in pages 201-204 of this book, which some parts of it are directly quoted as follow:

⁷¹ *God Passes by*, p.26. Persian version: *Qarn-e Badii*, p.97 (178)

⁷² Refer to the 7th part of this article to find out the confirmations and contradictions.

⁷³ Entitled as Azim (the greatest)

⁷⁴ *Summary of Nabil's Narrative*, p.280

The record of the meeting from the crown prince to Muhammad Shah

May I be scarified in your place!... first, Haj Mulla Mahmud asked him: 'we've heard that you claimed to be the deputy of Imam Mahdi and you are the gate (Bab) of Imam, and you've said something that indicates you are Imam, and even you are the prophet'. Then He answered: 'yes, my dear, I am the deputy of Imam, and I am the gate to Imam, and whatever you've heard about me is right. My obedience is obligatory for you'. ... Then they asked him about his miracles and wonders. he answered: 'my miracle is that I reveal a verse for my stick' and then he began to recite this : ' in the name of God, the compassionate, the merciful, Glory be To God, the most holy, the most glorified, who creates earth and heavens ,as he creates this stick to be a sign of his signs'. His pronunciations of the Arabic words were syntactically incorrect! He pronounced heavens as 'السّموات'. They asked him to pronounce 'السّموات'. He corrected the second word and pronounced it 'الأرض'.⁷⁵ Amir Arsalan Khan said 'if these are your signs and miracles, I can also make such verses easily!

الحَمْدُ لِلّٰهِ الَّذِي خَلَقَ الْعَصَا كَمَا خَلَقَ الصُّبْحَ وَالْمَسَاءَ !

Praise be to God who creates this stick the same as he creates morning and evening'. Afterwards, the Bab was very ashamed. ... then, they asked him some questions about jurisprudence and other sciences but he couldn't answer... when the meeting was terminated, Sheikh Ul-Islam was recalled and Bab was beat with a stick and he was punished and then he repented from whatever he had claimed. He promised seriously not do them again... the order is whatever you command... finished"

Naseruddin Mirza reported that Bab had syntactic mistakes in his speech. In addition to several mistakes in the Bab's speeches and writings, his revealed verses also, were so cheap that the participants made similar verse simultaneously, even without any

⁷⁵ In fact, if Bab wanted to recite the verse of Quran, he had to say: "خَلَقَ السَّمَوَاتِ وَالْأَرْضَ". First time, he pronounced it "خَلَقَ السَّمَوَاتِ وَالْأَرْضَ" and second time, again he made a mistake and read the verse:

"خَلَقَ السَّمَوَاتِ وَالْأَرْضَ". These Arabic syntactic rules are so rudimentary that are taught for high school students

mistake! Besides all of these, Naseruddin Mirza's findings of discussions are very important. He says that the Bab was punished and after this punishment, he repents and promises not to assert such claims again! Therefore, this official report can illuminate the way to find more about the Bab's other claims.

The letter of repentance

Following the previous part, *Golpayegani* in the book *Kasf-ul-gheta*, pages 204 and 205, cited the Bab's repentance letter and exponents' reply as follows:

Since this part aims only to narrate the Bab's repentant letter and his promise not to repeat such claims again, the content of the letter written by him is quoted directly and ... we set it up to the considerations of the men of foresight. The statement of the Bab handwriting to king Naser al-din in the days of his heirship to throne in Tabriz... 'May I be scarified to him... I witness that this weak servant doesn't have any knowledge against God's and his saint ship's satisfaction, although I am full of sins ... and if I've written some words against His pleasures, I didn't want to be sinful and by the way, I am repentant and regretful. This servant does not have any knowledge causing assertion of such claims; I seek God's forgiveness and I repent from whatever attributes to me. Some words and statements being expressed by me has no reason and my claim to be the special deputy of the lord of the age (Imam Mahdi) is completely vain and I've never had such a claim or other claims.'⁷⁶ I request the imperial kindness and I ask for your loyal forgiveness'.⁷⁷

The clergies of Tabriz replied on the top of the page

As it was mentioned, this meeting, in addition to records and the appendices (the Bab's repentant letter) has the signatures and explanations of the attendants. The clergies wrote some explanations about this meeting in the margins of the Naser al-din's letter and the Bab's repentant letter:

⁷⁶ How about his claim to be the promised Qa'im!

⁷⁷ As it was mentioned, one of the qualifications of the promised Imam is that there should be no oppressed ruler's allegiance submitted to him. If so, what do these statements mean? Does not it mean humility in front of a king?!

*Seyyed Ali Muhammad Shirazi, confessed in this meeting, wherein the crown prince, whom God may help, and other religious authorities have attended. These confessions are so clear that each of which can cause your apostasy and your execution, but what makes the delay in this execution is the question of your insanity ...*⁷⁸

As it is obvious, just a week after proclamation and being punished⁷⁹, Bab forgot all his claims. This made clergies of Tabriz to think that he was insane and finally, they decided not to sentence him to death, because of this insanity. After these punishments, the Bab was sent to Chehriq, and his followers were forbidden to call with him.

6-11) civil wars

Muhammad Shah (from Qajar dynasty) died in 1264 A.H. and the crown prince became the king of Iran. In the first days, like every young king, he was busy with internal wars and other competitors of kingship. He appointed *Mirza Taqi Khan-e Amir kabir* as his chancellor, by whom the Qajar court was settled down. At those days, the Bab's followers also had rebelled and made three civil wars in Iran. What happened in those revolts are as follows:

1- The first war occurred in Mazandaran near the Tabarsi fort (near Qaemshahr). The commander of Babis was *Mulla Hussein Boshroui*, the first believer. According to the Baha'i books, he moved from Khorasan to Mazandaran when the king had died.⁸⁰ The people in Mazandaran prevented the Bab's followers to enter the town.⁸¹ Therefore, they had no choice other than staying in Tabarsi fort. After some conflicts between people and the Bab's followers, the state army forces entered the scene to

⁷⁸ *Kashf al-gheta an Heial al-Ada* (uncovering the enemies' deceits), Abul-Fazl Golpayegani Kashf ul-gheta, p.205

⁷⁹ As it is mentioned in the Nabil's Narrative, p.324, he was given only 11 lashes on his feet.

⁸⁰ *Al-Kavakeb Al-dorriah*, Abdu l-Hussein Ayati, vol. 1, p. 134,135. This book is one of the most important historical books of Bahais whose author repented some years after its publication and converted to Islam. Consequently, Baha'is excommunicated him and he entitled himself as 'Avare' (homeless). Since he wrote this book before his conversion to Islam, it is an authoritative book for Bahais.

⁸¹ *Al-kavakeb Al-dorriah*, Abdu l-Hussein Ayati vol.1, p.137

fight the Babi warriors. Finally, they killed Mulla Husayn in the battlefield. After him, *Muhammad Ali Barforoushi, Qoddus*, became the commander. Since the blockage of the castle was prolonged, Babis' food supply was finished. *Shoghi Effendi* describes the adverse conditions of the Babi warriors in Tabarsi fort:

when their food was at first reduced to the flesh of horses brought away from the deserted camp of the enemy; when later they had to content themselves with such grass as they could snatch from the fields whenever they obtained a respite from their besiegers; when they were forced, at a later stage, to consume the bark of the trees and the leather of their saddles, of their belts, of their scabbards and of their shoes; when during eighteen days they had nothing but water of which they drank a mouthful every morning; when the cannon fire of the enemy compelled them to dig subterranean passages within the Fort, where, dwelling amid mud and water, with garments rotting away with damp, they had to subsist on ground up bones; and when, at last, oppressed by gnawing hunger, they, as attested by a contemporary chronicler, were driven to disinter the steed of their venerated leader, Mullá Husayn, cut it into pieces, grind into dust its bones, mix it with the purified meat, and, making it into a stew, avidly devour it. .⁸²

In those conditions, the Bab's followers behaved with each other quite kindly! While some of them were hungry in adverse circumstances, others were hoarding rough rice to satiate themselves secretly. *Abdul-Hussein Ayati* in the book *Al-Kavakeb Al-dorriah* describes this condition as follows:

*One day, Quddus went to one of his friends' house and found that they had stored some rough rice. He looked at them nervously and asked them: 'is this the manner of unity and loyalty that in this hard circumstance, you have stored rice, just thinking about yourselves?'*⁸³

⁸² *God Passes by*, p.30. Persian version: *Qarn-e Badii*, vol.1, p.111,112 (207, 208)

⁸³ *Al-Kavakeb Al-dorriah*, Abdul-Hussein Ayati, vol.1, p.174

Therefore, the followers of the promised Qa'im of the Baha'is were 313 persons, surrounded in Tabarsi fort, Behaved with each other in a kind manner as mentioned above! They not only gained no glorious victories, but also provoked different conflicts and unrests in Mazandaran. They thought it was the first step in their way to establish the government of universal justice, that Muslims awaited it for many years!

At last, they couldn't resist any more, and their leader, Quddus, and others were arrested by people and were sentenced to death for provoking civil wars in Iran.

2- The second conflict occurred in Neiriz, in Fars province. The Babi commander was *Seyyed Yahya Dara'bi*, known as *Vahid* among the Baha'is. His father was a Shaikhi clergy, believing in the Bab, as the forth pillar of the faith, after *Seyyed Kazem Rashti*. The significance of this battle was not more than that of Mazandaran⁸⁴ and it did not last so long. The Babi warriors were hardly defeated, some of them were killed in the battlefield, and others were arrested and executed in the month Shaban of 1266 A.H. since they had provoked unrest ,and fought with the official forces.

3- The third conflict occurred near Zanzan. Shoghi Effendi believes that this conflict was “*even more devastating than the two previous upheavals*”⁸⁵. The leader of the Babi warriors was *Mulla Mohammad Ali Zanzani*, known as *Hojjat*. His brave followers sought asylum in a castle again, surrounded by the government forces. *Shoghi Effendi* describes the number of the Bab's followers in this war: “*Which at one time sheltered no less than three thousand Bábís, including men, women, and children*”⁸⁶

⁸⁴ *God Passes by*, p.31. Persian version: *Qarn-e Badii*, vol.1, p.114 (212)

⁸⁵ *God Passes by*, p.32. Persian version: *Qarn-e Badii*, vol.1, p.116 (217)

⁸⁶ *God Passes by*, p.32. Persian version: *Qarn-e Badii*, vol.1, p. 117 (219)

After Bab's death and in the most important war between Bab's followers and army forces, his followers were only 3000 people. Therefore, Babis were not so much. These numbers were taken from Bahai books and even, they are not confirmed by other independent sources. Maybe by “Winning the hearts”, Shoghi Effendi and Bahauallah mean winning the hearts of these few people! As it is obvious, millions of Iranian people were not interested in what Bab had claimed. How about the world?

Finally, like other battles, Babi commander was arrested and executed and 1800 Babi people were killed during the battle.

6-12) some points about these civil wars

The first war occurred in 1264-1265 A.H. just after ending the Badasht gathering in Jamadi al-awal of 1264 A.H., Which was confirmed by the Bab. As it was mentioned, in this gathering, the abolition of Islam was proclaimed and consequently, the prayer-carpet was put aside not to be extended again! But despite this abolition, *Mulla Hussein Boshrouei*, the first believer, known as Bab ul-Bab, was praying every day⁸⁷ during the Tabarsi fort battle, asking the governmental and popular invaders: ‘do we turn any Halal (religiously lawful) into Haram (religiously unlawful) or vice versa?’

Mulla Mohammad Ali Zanjani also was praying every day⁸⁸ during the third war (Zanjan) in 1267 A.H., three years after Badasht event and actually after the Bab’s death. Therefore, it is obvious that the Babis who were killed in those battlefields were Muslims, not believing in the Bab as the promised Qa’im of Islam. Most of the Bab’s followers believed in him as the Bab (gate) of the twelfth Imam. Since getting information was completely different from nowadays, they were even unaware of his claim as the Promised Qa’im. Therefore, in reply to those who misuse the self-sacrifice of these ignorant followers to prove the truth of the Bab’s claims, it can be said that if they were informed about the Bab’s new claims, they would never sacrifice themselves. *Mulla Abdul-khalq Yazdi*, whose testimony was used to prove the truth of the Bab’s claims, is among those ignorant followers.⁸⁹ The Bab believed in Abdul-khalq to the extent that he wrote to Muhammad Shah:

“in any dispute, God requires the testimony of two witnesses, from the midst of all the learned, call Siyyid Yahyá and Akhund Mullá ‘Abdu’l-

⁸⁷ *Al-kvakeb Al-dorriah*, Abdul-Hussein Ayati, vol.1, p.134

⁸⁸ *Al-kavakeb Al-dorriah*, Abdul-Hussein Ayati, vol.1, p.195

⁸⁹ He imitated a verse of Quran in which the testimony of God and the one who has the knowledge of the book (i.e. Ali Ibn Abitalib) are used to prove the truth of the prophecy of the prophet of islam : chapter raad, verse 43

Khaliq. They will show you and will explain my verses, and the truth of my testimony will appear ... Of these two personages, one knew me before the manifestation, the other afterward; I have chosen them because they both know me well!” ⁹⁰

Abdul-khaliq's son was only 20 years old when was killed in the battlefield near the Fort of Tabarsi. Mulla Abdul-khaliq confessed that he had known the Bab after the manifestation of his Cause and he was aware of the truth of his testimony! However, after finding about the Bab's claim to be the promised Qa'im, he cried wailing: “*woe! My son was killed unjustifiably*” ⁹¹ so it is clear that the Cause confirmed by Mulla Abdul-khaliq had not been the Bab's claim to be the promised Qa'im. If it was so, he would not reject the Bab after hearing about this new claim and he would not talk about the vain death of his son.

6-13) the Bab's execution

As it was mentioned, the Bab began assertion of his claim to be the promised Qa'im in the last decades of 1264 A.H. and then, by writing the book of *Bayan (Exposition)* proclaimed the abolition of Islamic Sharia Law. Afterwards, he called himself a new prophet, and finally, in his last writing, claimed that he was god;⁹² his followers did not communicate with him when he was imprisoned in Chehriq up to his murder. That is why they were not aware of his latest claims. Surely, if they knew his new claims, the wars had finished much sooner, and the Bab had not been killed. As the internal wars increased, the Iran government had no choice but to order to kill the Bab, to settle down the unrests.⁹³ The clergies believed Mirza Ali Muhammad was mad and cannot be sentenced to execution. Therefore, they refrained to sign his death

⁹⁰ *The Dawn Breakers* (English translation of Nabil's Narrative), translated by Shoghi Effendi, footnote of p.160, *Matali'ul-Anvar* (Arabic translation of Nabil's Narrative), footnote of page 199.

⁹¹ *Tarikh-i-Zohour-ul-haq* (the history of advent of appearance), p.173. the complete description of this event are in the seventh part of this article.

⁹² Explanations of these claims are mentioned in the 7th part of this book

⁹³ *Al-Kavakeb Al-dorriah*, Abdul-Hussein Ayati, vol.1, p.233 , 249

sentence.⁹⁴ Finally, government insistence on his execution made some Shaikhi clergies like *Mulla Muhammad-e Mamaqani*⁹⁵ to pronounce the Bab's death. The Bab and one of his followers were executed by a firing squad in Tabriz, on 28th of Shaban, 1266 A.H. According to the French author, Counte De Gobinou, in his book *Religions and philosophy in the central Asia*, and Muslim historians, wild animals in a ditch outside of Tabriz, ate the Bab's body. However, the Baha'is assert that *Suleiman Khan Afshar* commissioned by *Mirza Hussein Ali (Bahauallah)*⁹⁶ stole the Bab's body and carried it to a silk-weaving factory, belonging to *Hajj Ahmad Milani*, the Bab's follower. Then they transferred his body to Tehran and after a long time (about 60 years), they carried it to Haifa, and buried it in the Bab's shrine.

7) The claims of Bab from the beginning to the end!

It is surprising that a messenger of God makes contradictory statements about the history of his invitation, his claims, and even his positions. Sometimes he calls himself the Bab (Gate) of the Awaited Imam; sometimes claims to be the same Awaited Imam; sometimes contravenes both of them, and grants no ranks for himself. Sometimes, asserts the claim to be the prophet of God, brings a divine book, and sometimes claims that he is the Almighty God!

7-1) are the Bab's claims explicit and clear?

In this part, five direct quotations from Bab will be cited. All of them are from the Baha'i books, and they prove the duality of the Bab's and Baha'is' claims. It is not

⁹⁴ *Al-Kavakeb Al-dorriah*, Abdul-Hussein Ayati, vol.1, p. 241. The author asserts that most of the law experts of Tabriz refused to pronounce Bab's execution because they believed he was insane. *God passes by*, Shoghi Effendi, p.36. Persian version: *Qarn-e Badi*, vol.1, p. 132 (256), the author asserts that the chancellor, Amirkabir, insisted the Bab's execution.

⁹⁵ *Talkhis-e Tarikh-i-Nabil (Summary of Nabil's Narrative)*, Ishraq-e Khavari, p.230. In this book, it is mentioned that Molla Muhammad-e Mamaqani had been Sheikhi. *Al-Kavakeb Al-dorriah*, Abdul-Hussein Ayati, p.241, it is mentioned that Molla Muhammad-e Mamaqani sentenced the Bab's execution.

⁹⁶ *Al-Kavakeb Al-dorriah*, vol.1, p.233,249

clear that he claimed to be the Bab of *Imam Mahdi* ,or to be the awaited Imam himself!

1- As it was mentioned in the third part of this book, the Bab in the beginning of his invitation proclaimed that he has received the commentary of Ahsanul-qesas (the best of stories, a commentary on chapter Joseph in Quran) from Muhammad ibn al-Hasan (the son Imam Hasan Askari). He used this document to prove the truth of his position as the forth pillar of the faith.

The Bab in the second year of his manifestation, 1261 A.H., in a letter known as *Alef supplication* addressed to one of the followers of *Seyyed Kazim Rashti*:

2- *“And they said that he asserts the claim of saints(vilayat) and its two sisters (the prophecy and prophetic mission according to the book of Asrar-ul-asar, p.66). May God kill them for such an accusation...; some people accused me to assert the claim to be the appointed deputy⁹⁷ and visiting of Imam Mahdi⁹⁸. May God damn them . The Lord of the Age (the 12th Imam), after the forth appointed deputies, has no specific deputy and whoever claim to visit the twelfth Imam without any reason, all people should refute him and they have to kill him. O my God, I call you as my witness that I don’t claim to visit your appointed Imam and to communicate with him... and I witness that today, your appointed Imam is Muhammad son of Al-Hasan, peace be upon him... ”⁹⁹*

3- Bab in the book of *Sahifeye-Adlieyeh*¹⁰⁰ (epistle of justice) describes the levels of divine knowledge and asserts :

⁹⁷ The appointed deputy is the one who is appointed to have this position by means of a letter from Imam. According to Shiite teachings, after four appointed deputies, nobody will have this position.

⁹⁸ Visiting imam here means meeting Imam by our will, which is impossible, according to the true narrations of Imam Mahdi, in the period of major occultation.

⁹⁹ *Asrarul-asar*, Fazel Mazandarani, vol.1, p.179-182. The author of the book believed that the Babwrote these because of reservation but he might forget Bahais’ ordinance on the abrogation of reservation at the period of Qa’im’s manifestation and appearance.

¹⁰⁰ Unfortunately, Bahais prevent publication of this book since there are obvious confessions about existence of Muhammad ibn Hasan or the twelfth Imam inside it. But, those followers of the Bab who are opponents of Bahais known as Azali people have published this book.

The third divine knowledge is knowledge of the Babs (communicators).in this level; the bounds should acknowledge the sanctity of the Commander of believers (Imam Ali) peace be upon him. ... The forth knowledge is the knowledge of Imamate (leadership). in this level, all creatures have to know the twelve holy individuals who are absolute saints¹⁰¹ ... Al-Hasan son of Ali, and Al-Hussein son of Ali, and Ali son of Al-Hussein, And Muhammad Son of Ali, and Jafar Son of Muhammad, and Mousa Son of jafar, and Ali Son of Mousa, and Muhammad Son of Ali, and Ali son of Muhammad, and Hasan son of Ali, and Al-hujjah Al-Qa'im Muhammd Ibn Al-Hasan, the Lord of the Age, and Al-Fateme Al-Seddiqeh (who is truthful) peace be upon them. These great suns and great stars, in every position are successors of the prophet Muhammad, peace be upon him and his progeny.¹⁰²

In addition to these three obvious confessions about the existence of Muhammad Ibn al-Hasan or *Imam Mahdi*, the awaited Imam of the Shias, mentioned in the authoritative Baha'i books, two other quotes are cited from the Bab and then, the readers themselves should judge about the truth of his claims.

In the first Quote, the Bab, despite all of his previously mentioned confessions about existence of Hujjat Ibn Al-Hasan (or *Imam Mahdi*), calls himself the Awaited Qa'im. Although some parts of this event was mentioned in part 6-12, reviewing what he has said is useful. The following quotes are from Bahauallah, mentioned in the book of *Tarikh-i-Zohourul-haq* (history of the advent of the truth), pages 173-174:

4- *In a tablet revealed by All glorious, it is written: in the beginning of the manifestation of Noqteh Oula' (Bab) which was asserting his claim as Bab, Mulla Abdul-khaleq who was a Sheikhi clergy, welcomed it, stated a petition respectfully. His invocation was revealed from the great source and he was under his patronage completely to the extent that a tablet was revealed for him specifically, in which this exalted statement had been mentioned "I am the true Qa'im whom you are promised for his*

¹⁰¹ In the second chapter, this part was mentioned as one of the Shias' basic beliefs about the twelfth Awaited Imam. So it is clear that the Bab, in this book, had such a similar belief about the twelve Imams specially the twelfth one.

¹⁰² *Sahifeye Adlieyeh*, Mirza Muhammad Ali Shirazi (the Bab), p.27

*appearance*¹⁰³, after reciting this part, he shouted and turned away completely and rebelled. Consequently, after his rejection, some people turned away in *Arz-e Ta'*.¹⁰⁴

Therefore, Bahauallah also confessed about the duality of the Bab's claim. First, he said that Bab appeared as the Bab of the awaited Imam; and then, he wrote a letter to Abdul-khaleq, who was Shaikhi, and claimed that he was the Qa'im, who they were waiting for his appearance.

As it was mentioned before, some Shaikhis like *Mulla Abdul-khaleq* who had accepted the Bab's claim as the Bab, rejected him when they found his new claim as the promised *Mahdi*. It proves the fact that many of the Bab's followers such as those who were killed in battlefields for his Cause, were not aware of his next claims. They only accepted him as the Gate or Bab (in the Shaikhi terms as the forth pillar of the faith), while the Baha'is, nowadays, misuse those sacrifices to prove the truth of the Bab's claims!

5- The last citation is about his claim to be God. Bab, in one of his latest writings on the last days of his life, known as *Loah-e Heikalul-din* has written : “ surely, Ali¹⁰⁵ before Nabil is God and His being !”¹⁰⁶

By reading such contradictory expressions, every fair researcher and reader will surprise, although God has promised such events in Quran: “do not then mediate in the Quran? If it were from any other than Allah they would have found therein many discrepancies.”4:82

Therefore, according to this verse, finding contradictions in the words of those attributing themselves falsely to God, should not be surprising.

7-2) what do the Bahai leaders think about the Bab's claim?

¹⁰³ إني أنا القائم الحق الذي انتم بظهوره توعدون

¹⁰⁴ By Arze Ta, he means Tehran

¹⁰⁵ According to Arabic syntax, the Bab should use "Alyyan", but he has used "Alyyon" and he has so many syntactic mistakes, like this one, in his writings and speeches.

¹⁰⁶ *Tablet of heikalul-din*, p.5

Although the Bab's confessions about existence of the twelfth Imam, Muhammad Ibn Al-hasan, are more than those three cases mentioned, the Baha'is only refer to the following forth one, and respect the Bab as the promised Qa'im. For example, Bahauallah, in his book, **Iqan** , which is written to prove the Bab's claim as Qa'im, rejects the deniers, and asserts:

those things to which the Jews and the Christians have clung, and the caviling which they heaped upon the Beauty of Muhammad, the same have in this day been upheld by the people of the Qur'án, and been witnessed in their denunciations of the "Point of Bayán"¹⁰⁷ - may the souls of all that dwell within the kingdom of divine Revelations be a sacrifice unto Him.¹⁰⁸

Shoghi Effendi, the second successor of Bahauallah, in his book of *God passed by*, writes:

He who communicated the original impulse to so incalculable a Movement was none other than the promised Qá'im (He who ariseth), the Sáhibu'z-Zamán (the Lord of the Age), who assumed the exclusive right of annulling the whole Qur'ánic Dispensation¹⁰⁹

Obviously, although Baha'i leaders attempt to prove the Bab's claim as the promised Qa'im, they couldn't hide his contradictions. They refer to some traditions to prove his claims; but by careful analysis of these traditions just his contradictions and his false claims become more obvious. In this part, only one of these traditions confirmed and misused by both the Bab and the Baha'is will be considered.

Bahauallah, in the book of *Iqan*, has used the tradition of Lawh Hazat-e Fateme (Prophet Muhammad's daughter) to show that the Bab was the promised Qa'im. He used the predictions about the difficulties that the followers of *Imam Mahdi* encounter

¹⁰⁷ It means the Bab

¹⁰⁸ **Kitab-i-Iqan** (the book of Certitude), Bahauallah, p.41 (Persian version, p.89)

¹⁰⁹ **God passes by**, Shoghi Effendi, p.7. Persian version: **Qarn-e Badi**, vol.1, p.40 (67)

in their lives, and matched them to the difficulties that Bab's followers tolerated. He asserts:

Even as it hath been recorded in the "Káfi," in the tradition of Jabír, in the "Tablet of Fátimih," concerning the character of the Qá'im: "He shall manifest the perfection of Moses, the splendour of Jesus, and the patience of Job. His chosen ones shall be abased in His day..." Consider, not a single letter of this tradition hath remained unfulfilled. In most of the places their blessed blood hath been shed; in every city they have been made captives, have been paraded throughout the provinces, and some have been burnt with fire.¹¹⁰

Shoghi Effendi also refers to this tradition and compares the fear, anxiety, killings and burnings predicted for the Shias¹¹¹ with the circumstances of Bab's followers in Tabarsi fort ,and writes:

To whom else could these significant words of Muḥammad, the Apostle of God, quoted by Quddús while addressing his companions in the Fort of Shaykh Tabarsí, apply if not to those heroes of God who, with their life-blood, ushered in the Promised Day?...Who else could be meant by this tradition, called Hadíth-i-Jabír, recorded in the Káfi,¹¹² and authenticated by Bahá'u'lláh in the Kitáb-i-Íqán, which, in indubitable language, sets forth the signs of the appearance of the promised Qá'im? "His saints shall be abased in His time, and their heads shall be exchanged as presents, even as the heads of the Turk and the Daylamite are exchanged as presents; they shall be slain and burned, and shall be afraid, fearful and dismayed; the earth shall be dyed with their blood, and lamentation and wailing shall prevail amongst their women; these are My saints indeed."¹¹³

¹¹⁰ *Kitab-i-Iqan*, p.163 (190)

¹¹¹ This prediction is for the period of occultation of promised Mahdi, not the period of his appearance, but Bahai leaders did not pay attention to trustworthy in narrating this tradition.

¹¹²

¹¹³ Qarn-e Badii, vol.1, p.186 (356); it should be mentioned that Seyyed Bab, in the book of Dalayel-e sabee(the seven reasons) page 47, has used this tradition and even, he asserts that Muhammad is the son of Imam Hasan-e askari.

Now, let's consider the content of this Islamic tradition, *the Tablet of Fatemeh*, confirmed and misused by the Bab, Bahauallah, and Shoghi Effendi to evaluate to what extent their comparisons were rightful.

One of the followers of the holy prophet Muhammad (PBUH) was *Jaber Ibn Abdullah Ansari*, being alive till the life of the 5th Imam of Shia, Imam Muhammad Baqer. One day, Imam Baqer told him: "O Jaber, please inform me about the Lawh (tablet) which you saw in my mother's hands, Hazrat Fatemeh!"

Jabber replied: "after the birth of *Hussein Ibn Ali Ibn AbiTalib* (the third Imam), I went to visit the prophet's daughter, to say congratulations to her. Then, I saw a green tablet in her hand, which I thought it was emerald (since it was very beautiful) and I saw that something is written on it which was similar to the light of sun (since it was very bright). I asked her about that tablet.

She replied : " God, Almighty, gave this tablet to my father, as a gift. My name, and my husband's name , Ali, and my sons ,who are successors of Ali, and names of their progeny is written inside it and my father gifted it to me to give glad tidings to me." Then Jaber said: "I took that tablet and read its content and wrote a copy for myself". Then Imam Baqir (S.A.) told Jaber : "O Jaber! Look at the version that you have written and I will recite it for you." Jaber looked at it and when Imam Baqir recited the tradition and finished it, Jaber said: " I witness God that whatever you've recited I had seen in the tablet .And this is the tradition:

*In the name of God, the Compassionate, the Merciful
This is a book from God, the Almighty and the Wise, towards
Muhammad, His prophet and His light, and His messenger and His veil
and His reason, which has been revealed by the faithful spirit (the
Gabriel) from God of the two worlds ¹¹⁴ ... I make you superior to all
prophets and consequently, I make your successor superior to all the
successors... and I reverence you and your grandsons, Hasan and*

¹¹⁴ To avoid lengthening, some sentences about the description of events in the life periods of Imams and some of their characteristics are omitted. Readers interested in the complete text of this tradition, can refer to the book of *Usul al-Kafi*, Sheikh Al-Koleini, vol.1, p.528.

Hussein... and I give reward and retribution according to the extent of obedience from the children of Hussein, whom the first one is Ali son of Hussein (Sajjad) and the master of worshipers... then his son who looks like his praised grandfather, Muhammad, who is splitter (Baqir) of my knowledge... those who doubt on Jafar (Imam Sadiq A.S.) will be perished... after him is Moses (the son of Jafar) whose lifetime period will be filled with dark seditions... woe! Curse be upon the opponents of Ali (Imam Reza A.S.) after finishing the life of Moses... I will satisfy Ali by his son Muhammad (Imam Javad A.S.)... I will transfer the Cause to Ali son of Muhammad (Imam Hadi A.S.) prosperously... the one who invites people towards my way and who is my knowledge treasurer will be from the progeny of Ali, his name is Hasan (Imam Hasan-e Askari A.S.) and then, I will terminate successor-ship by his son, Muhammad (Imam Mahdi A.S.) who is a compassion for the people of the world. My friends will be humiliated in the period of his occultation and their heads will be sent to others as a gift, they will be killed and be burned and they will be feared and apprehended permanently...,

Now, the question to be answered by the Baha'is and their leaders is whether "Muhammad Ibn Hasan, son of Ali ,son of Muhammad, son of Ali, son of Mousa, son of Jafar ,son of Muhammad, son of Ali, son of Hussein, son Ali Ibn Abitaleb", the twelfth Imam of Shia, known as the Remnant of God and the promised Qa'im of Islam? Is he the one that Bab claimed to be his Bab or deputy? Is he the one who was called the true Imam in the Alef supplication? Is it acceptable that Baha'i leaders compare the Bab's followers sacrifices with predictions about followers of a person called "Muhammad Ibn Al-Hasan al-Askari" and then conclude that Bab is that promised Qa'im , mentioned in the Islamic traditions?

8) Are the Baha'i reasons in proving the Bab's claims as the promised Qa'im acceptable?

The Baha'is try to make similarities between the Bab and the promised Qa'im. Since, according to many Quranic verses and traditions¹¹⁵, one of the main indicators of Qa'im's appearance is his victory against pagans and establishment of a universal government, all false claimers point to their victories in the battlefields as a proof of the truth of their claims. Two of these false claimers were *Mahdi Sudani*, a Sunni Muslim, and *Abu-Muhammad Abdu'llah Mahdi*, the founder of Fatimi dynasty in Egypt, who was an Ismaili Shia. Mirza Ali Muhammad Shirazi (the Bab), not only didn't attend in any battle, but also his followers were defeated many times, and, according to Baha'is, they never gained a victory in wars. Therefore, the Baha'is had no choice other than interpreting the mentioned victories in narration as an indicator of Qa'im's appearance to conquering the cities of the hearts. In order to prove the truth of the Bab's claim as Qa'im¹¹⁶, Baha'is select some of the Qa'im's characteristics mentioned in traditions, only some of them, and then try to conform them to the Bab. Surely, they never mention those characteristics that cannot be matched with Mirza Ali Muhammad. In the book of *Montakhab al-Athar*, Ayatullah Safi-e Golpayegani, many of the Qaim's characteristics are compiled, narrated by both the Shia and Sunni authorities. Some of those characteristics are as follow:

- Mahdi has the same name and the same appellative as the Prophet of Islam (PBUH) (48 traditions)
- There are twelve Imams, the first one is called Ali and the last one is Mahdi (p.b.u.t.) (91 traditions)
- Mahdi is the ninth descendent of Imam Hussein. (148 traditions)
- Mahdi is the fourth descendent from the progeny of Imam Reza. (95 traditions)
- Mahdi is the one who will fill the earth with justice. (123 traditions)

¹¹⁵ As it was mentioned in the second chapter

¹¹⁶ *Tarikh-i-Zohour ul-haq*, Fazel-e Mazandarani, p.173, 174. The Bab's claim is mentioned in 1-7 in which he addressed Mulla Abdul-Khaleq and claimed that he is the Qa'im whose appearance had been promised to Muslims.

- He is the one who will announce the Cause of God and the religion of Islam in the world, and he will dominate the world.(47 traditions)
- Mahdi is the son of Imam Hasan Askari. (146 traditions)
- Mahdi is the son of the lady of the slave girls of the world. (9 traditions)
- Mahdi is the twelfth and the last Imam. (136 traditions)
- Mahdi's birth is hidden from the people' eyes. (14 traditions)
- Mahdi is free from the enemies' allegiances and treaties. (10 traditions)
- Mahdi has a long occultation. (91 traditions)
- Mahdi has two occultations:The minor and major occultations. (10 traditions)
- Mahdi has a long life. (318 traditions)

If such characteristics cannot be attributed to a claimer, he cannot be the true Qa'im. As the result, just because some of the unclear characteristics of the Bab's life, that except the Baha'i sources, no other references confirm them, are matched with those of the promised Qa'im, his claims cannot be accepted. For example:

The Baha'is assert that one of the indicators of the *promised Mahdi* is the number of his followers which is 313 persons, and then they claim that the Bab is the promised Qa'im, since the number of his followers, in addition to Mulla Husein Boshruie, in the Tabarsi fort is 313¹¹⁷. The question is how do they know the exact number of the Babis in the Tabarsi fort? Which independent resource has confirmed those numbers? If it is so, why Abdul-Baha, in his *A traveler's narratives* emphasizes that only 110 people were ready to fight¹¹⁸ in the battle field and other were unable to fight? Furthermore, having 313 followers is enough to assert the claim to be the promised

¹¹⁷ An article is published in Bahai websites by an Iranian researcher

¹¹⁸ *A traveler's Narrative*, Abdul-baha, p.12. Persian version: *Maqaleh Shaksi Sayyah*, p.22 (40)

Qa'im? Therefore, matching only some characteristics of the promised Mahdi to the Bab, even if we accept their conformity¹¹⁹, cannot be a proof of the truth of his claims.

All of the Bab's characteristics mentioned in this part ,and in the second chapter of this book, concerning the Muslims' belief about the Bab, ¹²⁰ indicate that according to traditions and the verses of Quran, he cannot be the promised Qa'im. Furthermore, as it was mentioned in the seventh and the 8th part of the book, there are some dissensions between what the Bab has claimed and what the Bahai leaders, like Bahauallah, assert about him. With such background and confessions, can we accept the Bab as the promised Qa'im? It is obvious that there is no similarity between the promised Qa'im of Islam, and the one introduced by the Bahais as Qa'im!

9) The Writings of Bab

To complete our research about the Baha'is *promised Mahdi* and his characteristics, in this part, the author considers the Bab's workbook and the consequences of his claim in the history of Qajar dynasty in Iran. Regardless of the fact that he couldn't be accepted as the promised Qa'im, we want to find whether he had the characteristics of a peace-maker or not? Could his life's characteristics be matched with the life of a peace-maker, even not having relationship with God? Although his false claims cannot be ignored, to be impartial in our judgment, his workbook also will be considered concerning his teachings and the consequences of his uprising for the Iranians.

9-1) the Bab's knowledge

Bahauallah in the *kitab-i-Iqan* narrated a tradition from Imam Sadiq (A.S.) in which he says about Imam Mahdi (A.S.):

¹¹⁹ Any independent historical source, except those of Bahais, has not confirmed gathering of this number of people in the Tabarsi fort.

¹²⁰ It is recommended to consider those characteristics again and then. Match them with the Bab's attributes.

*Knowledge is twenty and seven letters. All that the Prophets have revealed are two letters thereof. No man thus far hath known more than these two letters. But when the Qá'im rises, He will cause the remaining twenty and five letters to be made manifest.*¹²¹

9-1-1) the Bab's opinion about his knowledge

The Bab, in his repentance letter to the Iranian King, asserts:

*I bear the witness of God and whatever is in his dominance that this weak servant doesn't have any knowledge against God's and his saint ship's satisfaction, although I am full of sins ... and if I've written some words against His pleasures, I didn't want to be sinful and by the way, I am repentant and regretful. **This servant does not have any knowledge causing assertion of such claims!!***

Therefore, he clearly asserts that he does not have any knowledge to bring any claim. Furthermore, according to Naseral-din Mirza's expression and Abdul-Baha's confession¹²², in the meeting of Naseral-din Mirza, he recited the Arabic sentences which were revealed by God syntactically incorrect. At those days, syntax had its own specific rules. Therefore, not only the Bab brings no new knowledge, but also he himself had been unaware of those simple rules. Even, he could not correct his mistakes after other's reminders.

9-1-2) regarding continuation of the previous tradition of Imam Sadiq (A.S.) and some few words omitted from its original text by Bahauallah¹²³:

*He will cause the remaining twenty and five letters to be made manifest and adds them to the two previous letters to make all twenty seven letters being available for people*¹²⁴.

¹²¹ *Kitab-i-Iqan* (the book of Certitude), Bahauallah, p.75. Persian version: p.162 (189)

¹²² *A traveller's narrative*, Abdul-Baha, p.8. Persian version: *Maqalih Shakhsi Sayyah*, p.13 (23)

¹²³ Could this omission be unintentionally?

Therefore, *the* Baha'is have to believe that Mahdi, in addition to confirming the two letters revealing by other prophets, will manifest the remaining twenty-five letters. Now, let's consider what the Bab ordered about the other books revealing before his manifestation. He writes: "*it is ordered to diminish all the books except those written for proving the Cause of God and his religion*"¹²⁵, although by 'the Cause of God' he means his own writings.

According to the tradition mentioned from the book of *Behar al-anvar*, used by Bahauallah in the book of *Iqan*, the emphasis is on adding the two remaining letters of knowledge to the previously revealed ones. However, Bab ordered to diminish those books, which do not prove his cause, and by this order, he acts completely against what has been predicted by Imam Sadiq (A.S.).

9-1-3) Among the progressive teachings of Bab for his followers is killing all people except his followers! To this end, he was not satisfied with less than beheading! Surely, this order cannot be a divine one and no intellect would pronounce such a sentence. Furthermore, he had ordered to burn all books, except those written to prove his claims! Another example of such burning can be found in the history and it is Chengiz Khan's commands in burning all large libraries of Iran during his attacks. Bahauallah also confirms this order from the Bab, and believes that such teachings are quite savagely. Then he expresses his satisfaction since those teachings have changed after death of the Bab, i.e. at the time of his own manifestation, and asserts:

The deniers and abnegators appealed to four words¹²⁶, the first word was beheading, the second was burning the books, the third one was avoiding other nations and the fourth one was devastating the parties. Now, because of the excellence and authority of the divine word, all of these great impediments

¹²⁴ *Bihar' al-Anvar* (the ocean of the lights), Allame Majlesi, vol.2, p.436. ((فَبَثَّهَا فِي النَّاسِ وَضَمَّ إِلَيْهَا الْحَرْفَيْنِ حَتَّى يُبَيِّنَهَا سَبْعَةً وَعِشْرِينَ حَرْفًا))

¹²⁵ Kitab—Bayan, the Bab, the Persian version, p.199. the sixth chapter of the sixth part, entitles as 'on the ordinance of diminishing all the books except those prevailed or prevailing the Cause'

¹²⁶ I.e. the Bab' opponents appealed to his speeches, used four quotes of his words, and indicated their objection by referring to these words.

were destroyed and these four true commands¹²⁷ were diminished from the tablet and the savage attributes changed to spiritual ones.¹²⁸

Abdul-Baha also criticizes the Babis' manner and summarizes the consequences of the writing of *Bayan* (Exposition) as follows: beheading people, burning libraries, destroying the tombs, and killing all people except those believing in the Bab. He asserts:

In the day of manifestation of the Exalted one, what had been said in the book of Bayan was beheading, burning the books and papers, destroying the tombs, and killing people except those who were believers and admitters.¹²⁹

Therefore, it is not surprising that such group with such teachings grid to kill their compatriots and by means of their bloody insurgences try to kill and plunder people. Even, if they assassinate wise clergies such as Molla Mohammad Taqi-e Qazvini,¹³⁰ there is no surprise since their leader ordered to kill all people except his own believers!

9-2) the political workbook of the Bab

The progress of the Babi group, under the support of Russia, is considered in the book of *The footprint of tsar*. Although it cannot be said decisively that the progress of Babi and Baha'i groups in Iran had been one of the policies of the tsarina Russia, one can obviously claim that without their helps and supports, these two groups could not advance any more.

Some of the damages inflicted to Iran by the Babi sedition are as follows:

¹²⁷ If these teachings cause savage attributes, why does Bahauallah call them 'the four true commands'?

¹²⁸ *The collection of tablets*, Bahauallah, p.294,295 (published in Egypt)

¹²⁹ *Makatib* (the writings), Abdul-Baha, vol.2, p.266

¹³⁰ The assassination of this wiseman was mentioned in the part 7-6 under the subheading of "preparation of Badasht event"

- After finishing the war between Iran and Russia, and the two shameful treaties of Golestan and Torkamanchay, the Iranian Government was so involved with the internal wars and religious disputes that it could not work anymore to recapture its own lands.
- After those incidents, Iran was so damaged that compensating the loss obliged the government to try hard and even to vend some parts of the country. According to well-known Iranian chancellor of the King Naser al-din, Amir kabir, Bahauallah only inflicted losses about 2.5 Million Tommans (five kurur tommans) ¹³¹upon the country, and the sum is equal to the half of the war indemnity paid by Iran to the tsarina Russia.
- The fear of killing and assassination had been prevalent in Iran. The country was so insecure that the king was assassinated. Although the attempt upon the king's life was unsuccessful, the agents were not arrested. The Bab's followers seduced all the principles of morality, and troubled and bothered people to the extent that Bahauallah who himself had been one of the Bab's followers, objected them and wrote:

In the beginning of the Cause, the acts were so wicked that every insightful man had to ask God to be saved and every hearer seek relief meekly in the daytime and night. ¹³²

According to what we know, *Mahdi (A.S.)* will come to fill the world with justice, to prevail security in the world, to irrigate those who are thirsty of divine and true knowledge. Does Bab fulfill all of these promises?!

10) Why the Baha'is quarrel with the *promised Mahdi of Islam*?

To introduce a new religion, Bahais have to talk about the Promised man of Islam. To this end, they have three choices:

¹³¹ *God passes by*, Shoghi Effendi, p.47. Persian version: *Qarn-I Badi*, vol.1, p.167 (315)

¹³² *Iqtedarat*, Bahauallah, p.21. This book consists of Bahauallah's letters to different people.

- 1- The belief in the Reappearance of Mahdi after manifestation of Bahauallah
- 2- The belief in the unity of his Reappearance and their religion,
- 3- The belief in the Reappearance of Mahdi before manifestation of their religion

They chose the third one, but accepting this choice needs the conformity of Mahdi's characteristics with the one they claim as their Mahdi. Since the documents do not prove the truth of this claim, to solve the problem, they decided to quarrel with the *promised Mahdi* of Islam in two ways.

First, they say that the Quranic predictions and the Islamic traditions regarding the promised Qa'im are inauthentic. They try to diminish the belief in *Mahdi* among the Muslims. To achieve this goal, they introduce Mahdi in such a manner that not only his aims, but also the consequences of the belief in such a Savior are not clear.

- Instead of expanding justice and removing oppression, they restricted the goals of *Mahdi's* uprising to conquering hearts of people. (even this attraction is limited to hearts of a few people not all mankind, as it was mentioned in previous chapters)
- Instead of expanding the religion of Islam throughout the world and prevailing monotheism, and inviting people to Islam and Quran, the Baha'is change the goals of *Mahdi's* uprising to abolition of the religion of Islam and prohibition of its ordinances!
- Finally, instead of establishment of the divine justice government and revenging from the historical oppressors and government of the pious and oppressed, the Baha'is change the decisive consequences of *Mahdi's* uprising to giving glad tidings to the next prophet, the one whose appearance causes no important change in the history of mankind!

Therefore, the Baha'is quarrel with the *Mahdi's* qualifications.

Second, the Baha'is change the authentic beliefs with superstitions, mix the true traditions with lies, and prepare the conditions for Muslims to turn away from the promised *Mahdi* to a person like Bab. To this end, they refer to some weak traditions and try to adopt them with the Bab's characteristics, and then assert that *Mahdi* had not been the son of Imam Hasan Askari (A.S.), to prove the Bab's claim as *Mahdi*. By such conformity, they aim to illuminate the way for propagation of their beliefs. To achieve this goal, they cause Muslims to doubt about the existence of Mahdi and question his life and occultation. But these questions will have no impact on the beliefs of Muslims who have been waiting for the golden age of Mahdi's appearance and the result will be only infamy for Baha'is and other false claims.

To avoid long discussions, all the documents were not mentioned in this book, but both manners were considered. The *Baha'I Research* center promises to publish another book ,concerning the second way in which the Baha'is try to destroy the belief of Muslims about the Mahdi's characteristics and qualifications.

It is noteworthy that Baha'is are not only under question by the discussions of Mahdaviyat; they should also answer the question - alongside other questions- regarding unconformity of appearance of a new prophet with the unanimously accepted principle of the Muslims about the holy prophet Muhammad (PBUH) as the Seal of the prophets. Other discussions concerning these questions will be published in our next books.

Reminder:

The *Baha'i Research* website is ready to answer your questions about Bahaim.

The website: www.Bahairesearch.org

Email address: info@bahairesearch.org

ترجمه جلد ۵ بهائی پژوهی — مهدی ستیزان